

# Case Study of E-government Public Service Reform in Southeast Sulawesi Province Government

Ginung Pratidinaa\*

*Public Administration, Djuanda University, Ciawi Toll Road No. 1 PO Box 35 Bogor 16720*

*Email: ginung.pratidina@unida.ac.id*

## Abstract

Public service through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system because there is still a culture of prioritizing each other, meaning that those who come first must be served first and vice versa, those who come later are served later, not those who come later are served first than those who come first. This is caused by the factors of "service through the back door", "service for cigarette money bribes", "service through shortcut practices". That is why the implementation through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system is very important. Thus, the application of ICTs and IT which is the basis for the development of E-Government which contains telematics and electronic data processing becomes a necessity as a normative reference and formal reference that is adhered to by all levels of government. The purpose of this study is to explain the bureaucratic practices in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government. Explain the efforts to provide the best, transparent and accountable services, analyze the factors that cause public services to be organized through e-government; The approach used is "Phenomenology", while the method used is secondary data study by studying various literatures and research results. Meanwhile, the data analysis uses content analysis. The results of the study show that the "One Door" public service through the implementation of the E-Government service system. Efforts to provide the best public service are through efficient, effective and productive work planning programs by providing beneficial contributions to the wider community. The factors that cause public services through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system are the Dirty Play of People in Institutions, the Existence of a Culture of Preceding Each Other, Low Employee Discipline, Thus the application of ICTs and IT which is the basis for the development of E-Government as a normative reference for all levels of government.

**Keywords:** accountability; reform; bureaucracy; service; public.

---

*Received:* 2/29/2025

*Accepted:* 4/29/2025

*Published:* 5/10/2025

---

\* Corresponding author.

## **1. Introduction**

Public service through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system because there is still a culture of prioritizing each other, meaning that those who come first must be served first and vice versa, those who come later must be served later, not those who come later are served first than those who come first. This is caused by the factors of "service through the back door", "service for cigarette money bribes", "service through shortcut practices". Efforts to provide the best public services through efficient, effective and productive work planning programs by providing beneficial contributions to the wider community have also not been optimal. This way of working has not provided a positive impact on the community, so that the community has not felt the service because the bureaucracy is not yet transparent, fair and accountable, enriched by the work planning process and work ethic to achieve good public services according to the objectives of bureaucratic reform itself. Therefore, it can be said that the factors that cause public services through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system are in order to eliminate the Dirty Play of Ordal (Insiders) of Institutions, Prevent the Culture of Preceding Each Other, Increase Employee Discipline in Entering and Leaving the Office Not on Time, and Implementing the Benefits of Public Services Through E-Government

Therefore, the bureaucratic reform being carried out by the Ministry of State Apparatus Order is the core of thinking (mainstream) in realizing good governance. The existence of this Bureaucratic Reform program cannot be separated from changes in governance from global society to a new state and a new state to old society. From the level of the nation state, bureaucratic reform is forced to change because of the demands that bureaucratic implementers must be competent and professional in carrying out their duties efficiently and effectively in order not to hinder the goals that have been set as stated in the vision and mission of bureaucratic reform. While globally, the bureaucracy cannot follow the demands of the international world which is so penetrating in various dimensions of life so that bureaucratic implementers must provide better and quality public services, because all dimensions of life have a significant relationship with the flow of foreign changes that require changes to the bureaucratic system in Indonesia, especially in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government. The phenomenon of "One Door" public service through the implementation of the E-Government service system has not been optimal because there is still a culture of prioritizing each other, meaning that those who come first must be served first and vice versa, those who come later must be served later, not those who come later are served first before those who come first. This is caused by the factors of "service through the back door", "service for cigarette money bribes", "service through shortcut practices".

Efforts to provide the best public service are through efficient, effective and productive work planning programs by providing beneficial contributions to the wider community. This way of working will have a positive impact on the community, so that the community can feel the service because it works transparently, fairly and accountably from every work planning process and work ethic to achieve efforts that provide good public services according to the objectives of bureaucratic reform itself. Factors that cause public services through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system are the Dirty Play of Ordal (Insiders) of Institutions, Preventing the Culture of Preceding Each Other, Increasing Employee Discipline Entering and Leaving the Office Not on Time, and Implementing the Benefits of Public Services Through E-Government The phenomenon from global society to a new state and a new state to old society, especially the development of

science and information and communication technology. Both in the form of ICTs and IT which are then called the digital era are challenges for government institutions or institutions to have to carry out bureaucratic reform according to global demands.

The synergy between the new state and global society factors encourages the bureaucracy to make changes, both changes in the way of thinking/mindset (paradigm change) and organizational and management changes on how the government becomes more adaptive and effective in facing the changes that occur. As a consequence, then the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government must build an appropriate and targeted government system that can be reached by the wider community, namely public services through E-Government to prevent the practice of (a) Collusion, Corruption and Nepotism, (b) provide public services that can meet the expectations of the community, (c) can achieve optimal levels of efficiency, effectiveness and productivity, (d) achieve transparency and accountability of a dignified government bureaucracy and (e) increase employee discipline and work ethic [1] The paradigm of one-stop service through E-Government has promised the realization of a clean and transparent government as expected by the entire community in each region, an optimistic idea that with the implementation of E-Governance it will be able to change the behavior and culture of the bureaucracy gradually towards a professional bureaucracy [7]

Thus, since the issuance of Presidential Instruction No. 3 of 2003 concerning national policies and strategies for developing E-Government, all levels of government, from the central to the regional levels, must implement E-Government, including the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government. Thus, the application of ICTs and IT which is the basis for developing E-Government containing telematics and electronic data processing becomes a necessity as a normative reference and formal reference that is adhered to by all levels of government.

## **2. Research Objectives**

The objectives of this study are as follows:

1. Explaining Bureaucratic Practices in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government
2. Explaining efforts to provide the best, transparent and accountable services
3. Analyzing factors that cause public services to be organized through e-government;

## **3. Materials and Methods**

### **Methods and Approaches**

This research is a "Phenomenological" perspective. The Phenomenological perspective sees human behavior about what they say and do as a result of them understanding or comprehending what they do [3]. While the method used is based on the method of reviewing related laws and regulations, including the results of the assessment, and then synergized with the user's need assessment so that in turn the results of activities are obtained in accordance with the regulations while answering the needs of users and it is hoped that the results of

this study will provide the best, transparent and accountable service from the existing state civil apparatus [9]

### **Time and Place**

This research began from July to December 2019 in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government

### **Population and Sample**

The population used was all apparatus in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government, while the sample taken was 10 informants through strict selection. The researcher believes that by taking strict informants, correct information will be obtained. Therefore, sampling was carried out purposively (intentionally) [14]

### **Types of Data and How to Collect**

Them The data taken is secondary data conducted through various existing literature and documents. The documents are obtained through existing informants to obtain accurate information. Meanwhile, for data collection, two methods are used, namely triangulation of data collection methods and triangulation of data sources [2].

a. Observation here means ordinary observation where the researcher is outside the agency and only collects data through various literature, informants and existing documents [16]

b. Interviews are conducted through the distribution of interview guidelines to specific informants who have been determined purposively (purposive sampling) by building cooperation between several agencies and informants in obtaining valid information [8]

### **Data Analysis**

Data and information obtained verbally and non-verbally through various studies conducted by previous researchers, literature and documents are analyzed through content analysis [13].

## **4. Results**

### ***4.1. Bureaucratic Practices in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government***

The bureaucratic practices that exist today are models that have been developed by Max Weber in society called a state institution that Weber called a bureaucratic organization. The logical reason is that when Max Weber developed his paradigm in an observation of bureaucracy, he found the overall posture as a useful tool to carry out more rational roles and functions when carrying out routine tasks that are independent in order to achieve efficiency, but today's practices are apparently unable to serve the practices of Collusion, Corruption and Nepotism. This can be seen from the performance of employees who have not improved the quality in carrying out services to the community, so that the hope of achieving a level of efficiency, effectiveness and productivity of performance has not been implemented optimally, coupled with public services that have not shown

transparency and accountability from the apparatus that carries out the public service so that it is reasonable to say that public services can be said to be still low because they still contain the practice of "backdoor" services, "pelican money", "toll roads" and so on.

For example, the complicated survey permit service between agencies. When taking care of the research permit for A. Iskandar and his friends in Southeast Sulawesi, it was initially processed to the Provincial Political Development Unit Office (Kesbangpol), but from the Provincial Political Development Unit Office (Kesbangpol) they were told to go to the One-Stop Service Office, but it turned out that from the One-Stop Service Office, they were told again to go to the Kendari City Political Development Unit Office (Kesbangpol), but from here they refused because the Kendari City Political Development Unit Office (Kesbangpol) did not have the right to issue a permit. From the Kendari City Political Development Unit Office (Kesbangpol) they were told again to go to the Provincial Political Development Unit Office (Kesbangpol) and from here there was a long debate between the researcher and the existing State Civil Apparatus and finally after the head of the Provincial Political Development Unit Office (Kesbangpol) found out, the research permit was issued. From here it can be seen that the motive for the delay in the permit can have various interpretations, for example, maybe they had to be given a bribe, and so on.

In order to improve the performance of public services as explained above, more adaptive, innovative and reformist efforts are needed to create more modern bureaucratic reforms according to the demands of the times, all of which are of course in order to provide optimal services in carrying out procedures and mechanisms as well as the system of organizing the wheels of government concerning institutional aspects, administration and human resources (personnel). The government through the Ministry of State Apparatus Empowerment has issued Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment Number PER/15/M.PAN/7/2008 concerning General Guidelines for Bureaucratic Reform. These guidelines are intended to accelerate the achievement of good governance in the context of bureaucratic reform in all Services, Agencies, and Agencies under the authority and jurisdiction of the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government. These guidelines are expected to be a reference for the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government in preparing and implementing bureaucratic reform programs in their

The Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government in 2019 has implemented a number of bureaucratic reform agendas, including System Arrangement. In general, the implementation of the bureaucratic reform agenda in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government is aimed at building or forming a clean, effective, efficient, productive, transparent, accountable and serving bureaucracy. Meanwhile, the target of implementing the bureaucratic reform agenda in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government is to change the mindset and work culture (culture set) as well as the government management system from (a) the institutional side is the realization of an organization that is appropriate in function and size, (b) the cultural side is the creation of a bureaucracy that has high integrity and performance, governance is the realization of a clear, effective, efficient, measurable system, process and work procedures in accordance with the principles of good governance, (c) the regulatory-deregulation side is the formation of a more orderly, non-overlapping and conducive regulatory bureaucracy, (d) in the human resources sector is the establishment of an apparatus with integrity, competence, professionalism, high performance and prosperity.

Because the service problems in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government are complicated when implementing excellent service to the community. These shortcomings are the consequences of building a more open service posture, which can be accounted for in order to avoid irrational services such as convoluted procedures. Therefore, in order to carry out the role and function of each state apparatus, it is mandatory to have a more modern performance pattern or model, and therefore the stages of action need to refer to the national or general bureaucratic reform policy. For this purpose, it is carried out through formal channels and short hierarchical levels, making the bureaucratic apparatus have enough activities to make decisions or act quickly, have fluency with local conditions, and have the sensitivity to pay attention to special problems and the needs of the typical community that often arise at any time.

Therefore, good bureaucratic practices are the characteristics of an organizational model whose structure is designed in such a way that it can optimally use professional personnel in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government managed better, impersonal and free from indifferent and uncaring attitudes. That is why the bureaucracy in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government which has the capacity as a ruler has the authority to organize regularly regarding specialization, hierarchies that can be elaborated well. Therefore, the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government which has legitimate authority and legitimacy needs to pay attention to the following things (1) enforcement of legitimate rules in this case the top leadership must instruct to increase high compliance of the State Civil Apparatus, (2) Sanctions are qualitative regulatory formulations that are applied to crucial problems that are violated by employees who act carelessly and stupidly, (3) Employees who carry out routine tasks must also obey the existing bureaucratic ethics. (4) Personnel obedience should not necessarily be to the leader who holds authority except to the existing rules of the game because the leader is only the holder of the mandate and legitimacy that is regulated in a systematic manner.

#### ***4.2. Efforts to Provide the Best, Transparent and Accountable Services***

Efforts to provide good public services are if you design a good strategic direction program, organize a bureaucratic system in an accountable manner, organize an organization that is appropriate in function and use, organize an open bureaucratic system, formulate a management system that can carry out management functions properly, efforts to strengthen existing units in an organization. implement all correct laws and regulations and carry out regular supervision. This is shown through maximum work productivity through optimal work ethics by each employee, both regarding work volume and workload. Therefore, work planning is needed every day, every week, every month, must be carried out regularly without regular planning, efforts to provide good, open and accountable services cannot be achieved. That way, efforts to provide good, open and accountable services will definitely be achieved. Activities like this certainly want a bureaucracy that is free from all storage, both storage of the rules of the game or bureaucracy that leads to subjective bias called collusion, corruption and nepotism.

That is why an efficient, effective and productive work planning program is needed so that every employee who runs the program can provide a beneficial contribution to the wider community. This way of working will have a positive impact on the community, so that the community can feel the service because transparent, accountable work is a bureaucracy that is responsible for its services from every work planning process and work ethic to

achieve efforts that can meet the hopes and desires of the community according to the goals of bureaucratic reform itself [11] According to the opinion [5] that every activity carried out by the State Civil Apparatus must provide benefits from every activity that can create satisfaction for everyone who is served both physically and psychologically According to the opinion [12] that the problem of public service is a problem that touches on the needs of individuals or communities who deal directly with institutions or institutions as regulated through the ethics of public administration run by the organization concerned. While According to [6], there are three types of services from government institutions. The categorization of these services is guided by the characteristics and nature of the activities and output of the service, namely (1) administrative services (2) goods services and (3) service services. These three types of services are expected to provide optimal service quality.

Quality is basically related to productive human resources in the sense of having rational thinking power, having high performance, having prime energy, being physically and mentally healthy, and having great creativity and innovation. Daring to face the risks that occur in the sense of having a strong fighting spirit, daring to face intellectual competition, daring to uphold the truth without hesitation because of having high selective power, being able to control oneself in any situation, being able to carry out activities independently as long as they master the problem, being able to face the consequences that come in the sense of having high reasoning and having high reasoning power, daring to also admit personal shortcomings and acknowledge the advantages of others, and being free to give opinions, suggestions and proposals whether asked or not. In [4]'s view, service quality includes several elements, namely (1) services to the community must be open, not closed, easy and traceable by all citizens who need them and prepared completely and easy to understand (2) public services can be morally accounted for in accordance with applicable regulations (3) public services depend on the situation where the service depends on the conditions and abilities of the officers who serve and the community receiving the service while still paying attention to the principles of efficiency and effectiveness (4) public services require participation between service providers, namely public services that can always encourage community participation by paying attention to the aspirations and needs expected by the community and (5) Public services must be neutral without containing any elements of discrimination against ethnicity, religion, race and social class or strata. (6) Public services must maintain a balance between rights and obligations, meaning that public services must be fair without being biased or lenient towards one party. With this type of service, quality public services can be created, which can lead to satisfaction among the community.

According to [15] that satisfaction as a person's level of similarity after comparing the performance (results) felt with their expectations, According to [16] it is explained that satisfaction is essentially related to the needs factor of a person (customer). This means that if a person's needs are met then the person feels satisfied, and vice versa. Then according to the perspective of [15] that public satisfaction can create a consistent attitude and commitment to the government agency or institution. So that satisfaction is basically a series of efforts that can create a sense of public satisfaction because it can fulfill the hope of being able to live prosperously, live happily because of prosperity and happiness of the community because of the intensive communication between the community and the authorities so that it has a positive impact because of the harmonization of service providers with service recipients. Furthermore, according to the opinion of [17] emphasizing that public satisfaction is seen and felt from a person's feelings comfortably after comparing the problems faced with the expectations obtained

#### **4.3. Factors That Cause Public Services Through E-Government**

The factors that cause public services through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system are as follows:

1. Dirty Play by Ordal (Insiders) of Institutions
2. Preventing the Culture of Preceding Each Other
3. Discipline of Employees Entering and Leaving the Office Not on Time
4. Benefits of Public Services Through E-Government

##### **ad. 1. Playing Insiders Institutions**

Public Service through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system because there are many cases in Southeast Sulawesi so that there are no irregularities, especially in the recruitment of workers both in foreign companies and in government agencies. One concrete example is (1) the entry of illegal foreign workers in several Chinese companies, even though when researchers interviewed immigration officials, it turned out that they also did not know that there were illegal foreign workers, (2) when researchers conducted in-depth studies on foreign workers from China, it turned out that there were workers who worked as soldiers. When researchers interviewed the Head of the Manpower Office, he was surprised that there were foreign workers in the foreign company. This means that there must be insiders who deliberately brought in illegal foreign workers who work as soldiers.

##### **ad.2. Preventing the Culture of Preceding Each Other**

Public services through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system is to prevent each other from preceding each other, meaning that those who come first must be served first, do not let those who come later be served first than those who come first. This means that the culture of bribery through the modus operandum "through the back door", "giving cigarette money", "taking shortcuts" must be prevented through online one-door services or E-Government. Thus the rotten practice of Collusion and Nepotism (KN) must be cut so that such practices occur, because on the one hand disappointing others while on the other hand making others happy. [10].

##### **ad.3. Employee Discipline Entering and Leaving the Office Not on Time**

Employee discipline in carrying out attendance is not on time, this can be seen when researchers visit several Departments and Offices, it turns out that it is already office hours but there are no employees in the Office. Therefore, service through E-Government by implementing online attendance is very appropriate because it can easily detect which employees come in on time and which employees leave the office on time. Because online attendance is a social control function from the leader to his subordinates so that the implementation of time



discipline is more executive, because this kind of attendance pattern, all employees will not escape the control of the leader.[4]

#### **ad.4. Benefits of Public Services Through E-Government**

Benefits of Public Services Through one door by implementing E-Government will promise the creation of clean, transparent and fair bureaucratic practices to respond to the hopes of all upper class society, middle class especially lower class. Thus it is time to implement E-Government in every Service or Office in the Regency or Sub-district area, especially Provincial Level Offices and Services automatically implement E-Government services so that pessimistic feelings become optimistic feelings from the community who use E-Government services. Of course, services like this need to be supported by professional, competent human resources accompanied by high morals, consistent attitudes and commitment to the agency where they work. Because e-governance services will change the behavior and work culture of the bureaucracy gradually but surely towards a proportional bureaucracy [4]

The consequence is that all employees without exception must master the application of Information, Communication and Technologies (ICTs). ICTs applications are different from Information Technology (IT). The use of Information, Communication and Technologies (ICTs) applications is intended to encourage the process of implementing external transformation of the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government through governance and communication of information commonly referred to as digital connections. So these digital connections include: (1) interaction between fellow employees in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government environment with the intention of building an understanding of cooperation between stakeholders, (2) interaction between the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government and the wider community to further create public trust in the role and responsibility in serving the community; (3) interaction between the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government and the world of commerce with the intention of further improving services in the business and commercial fields; (4) interaction between Non-Governmental Organizations in order to encourage the process of learning, collaboration and synergy between the government and the private sector; (5) interaction between communities in the context of socio-economic empowerment. On the other hand, Information Communication (IT) is specifically used to automate the process of data cleaning, data editing, data entry, data processing that is carried out internally. So the application of ICTs changes the perspective from e-administration (improving the implementation of orderly government) to e-citizens (improving the relationship between the government and its citizens), e-services (improving public services) and e-society (interaction and synergy between various components of society). The three domains each intersect or synergize as a force for the creation of good governance through e-governance.

#### **5. Conclusion**

The conclusion that can be drawn from this study is as follows: The "One-Stop" public service through the implementation of the E-Government service system is not optimal because there is still a culture of prioritizing each other, meaning that those who come first must be served first and vice versa, those who come later are served later, not those who come later are served first rather than those who come first. This is caused by the

factors of "service through the back door", "service for bribes on cigarette money", "service through shortcut practices".

Efforts to provide the best public service are through efficient, effective and productive work planning programs by providing beneficial contributions to the wider community. This way of working will have a positive impact on the community, so that the community can feel the service because it works transparently, fairly and accountably from every work planning process and work ethic to achieve efforts that provide good public services according to the objectives of bureaucratic reform itself.

Factors that cause public services through "One Door" by implementing the E-Government service system are the Dirty Play of Ordal (Insiders) of Institutions, Preventing the Culture of Preceding Each Other, Increasing Employee Discipline in Entering and Leaving the Office Not on Time, and Implementing the Benefits of Public Services Through E-Government

### **Acknowledgements**

This research can be done through secondary data, which is then raised as a research idea, then poured into a scientific research design with funding from the researcher (independent research). This research can be successful with the financial support and direction of several informants so that the results of this study meet the level of reliability and validity of data that can be scientifically accounted for. Therefore, the researcher would like to express many thanks to the Rector of Djuanda University who has provided support to the researcher to conduct research in the Southeast Sulawesi Provincial Government area. In addition, the researcher also expresses high appreciation to the Dean of the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, the Head of the Public Administration Study Program, along with all colleagues and administration who have helped the researcher in conducting this research.

### **Bibliography**

- [1] Agus Kurniawan dalam Falih Suaedi. *Revitalisasi Administrasi Negara*. Yogyakarta, Graha Ilmu, 2010, pp 53-64
- [2] Andarusni A, dan Mariyani. "Seni Mengelola Data: Penerapan Triangulasi Teknik, Sumber dan Waktu pada Penelitian Pendidikan Sosial.HISTORIS". *Kajian Penelitian dan Pengembangan Pendidikan Sejarah*, Vol 5, pp. 146-150, 2020
- [3] Bodgan, R, dan Taylor, S. *Kualitatif Dasar-Dasar Penelitian*. Surabaya, Penerbit Usaha Nasional. 1993, pp. 44-45
- [4] Falih Suaedi, *Revitalisasi Administrasi Negara*. Yogyakarta, Graha Ilmu, 2010, pp 53-64
- [5]Gibson, James L, Ivan Cevich Donelly, *Organisasi dan Management, Perilaku Struktur Proses*, Jakarta, Erlangga, 1989, pp

- [6]Kepmenpan No 58 Tahun 2002 tentang Pengelompokan Jenis Pelayanan di Instansi Pemerintah dan BUMN/BUMD
- [7]Lembaga Administrasi Negara Tahun 2000 tentang Implementasi E-Governance dan Penerapan Information Communication Technologies (ICTs).
- [8] Mita Rosaliza. (2015). "Wawancara Sebuah Interaksi Komunikasi Dalam Penelitian Kualitatif", Jurnal Ilmu Budaya, Vol 11, pp. 71-79, 2015
- [9] Nadia, A. "Implementasi Kebijakan Pengembangan Pariwisata Melalui Ajang Mojang Jejak Sebagai Duta Pariwisata". Jurnal GOVERNANSI, Vol 9, pp. 71-73, 2023
- [10]Pramuka, Gatot, et.al Modul Aplikasi Elektronik Governance: Studi Kasus di Berbagai Daerah. Laporan Penelitian Tidak Dipublikasikan. Yogyakarta, Graha Ilmu, 2005, pp 65-82
- [11]Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara No 85/M.PAN/7/2008 tentang Pedoman Umum Reformasi Birokrasi
- [12]Sinambela, et.al, Reformasi Pelayanan Publik: Teori Kebijakan dan Implementasi. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara 2006
- [13] Susilawati Gunawan, Iis Sinsin, Andri Yan Prima Zani. "Hubungan Antara Pengetahuan dan Sikap dengan Perilaku Pencegahan COVID-19 Pada Peserta Seminar Online STIKes Raflesia". Indonesian Journal of Health Promotion and Behavior, Vol 3, pp. 47-57, 2020
- [14] Sugiyono. Metode Penelitian Administrasi Dilengkapi dengan R&D. Bandung, Alfabeta, 2012, pp.90-103
- [15]Tjiptono, Fendy, Management Jasa, Yogyakarta, Andi 1996
- [16] Veny Ari Sejati. „Penelitian Observasi Partisipatif Bentuk Komunikasi Interkultural Pelajar Internasional Embassy English Brighton United Kingdom“, Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial, Vol 20, pp. 21-24, 2019
- [17]Wexley dan Yulk, Perilaku Organisasi dan Psikologi Industri Personalia. Terjemahan Muh. Sobarudin. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 1992