

The Dynamics of Civic Identity Construction in Post-War and Newly Independent Kosovo: A Discourse Analysis of Citizenship Education Curriculums and Textbooks in the First Decade of the 2000s

Ereblir Kadriu *

University of Prishtina “Hasan Prishtina” – Prishtina, 10000, Kosovo

Email: ereblir.kadriu@uni-pr.edu

Abstract

This paper analyses the process of creation of the new citizenship identity among young people in Kosovo through formal education, specifically, through mandatory Citizenship Education courses in schools.

A discourse analysis of the Citizenship Education Curriculum and Textbooks, employed in this paper identified five major components of the civic identity among young people that was promoted, in the first decade of 2000s in Kosovo:

1. Political and Social Literacy, 2. Political and Social Participation, 3. Cosmopolitanism and not nationalism 4. Media, environmental and global critical thinking, and 5. European and International integration.

The paper discusses the attempts, governmental official discourse, to create a new system of meaning about the new civic identity in relation to Kosovo's unique statue of a post-war and newly independent, who although has not yet fully reconciled with the past, is in the process of re-definition of statehood and identity.

Keywords: Identity Construction; Discourse; Citizenship/Civic Identity; Citizenship Education; Kosovo.

Received: 6/19/2023

Accepted: 7/24/2023

Published: 8/6/2023

* Corresponding author.

1. Introduction

The Newly (Contested^a and Unsettled^b) Republic of Kosovo - On February 17, 2008, Kosovo was declared to be an independent country: “a democratic, secular and multi-ethnic republic, guided by the principles of non-discrimination and protection under the law” (Kosovo Declaration of Independence). Although, formally and legally, Kosovo possesses elements of an independent country, its existence is not uncontested, both internationally and locally. Kosovo has not been internationally recognized as an independent country by all United Nations – UN - nor European Union - EU member states. In different part of the country, primarily north, its citizens – primarily those of Serbian ethnic background – do not recognize Kosovo as a new independent country. Thus, Kosovo “remain both a contested territory and an unsettled state”[46: 77].

Nevertheless, as a new country, Kosovo underwent, and is undergoing, through several significant processes simultaneously, which inevitability led to changes, or attempts to change, in both values and practices, in all aspects of social life. As it is trying to reach closure for the 13,535^c people dead or missing during the war, Kosovo continues to go through a rapid transformation of “the cultural frame in which the future Kosovar identity will officially develop itself: the Western one.” [1:24]. These transformations are seen in all social institutions of the country but are primarily visible in education. Education is widely recognized as a powerful social institution that serves as a catalyst for initiating transformations, instilling new values, and promoting different practices within society.

Following the war, Kosovo’s previous education system was ‘fundamentally altered’ [27: 277] with anticipations of building a new system aligned with that of the EU and the western world in general. Perhaps a fundamental transformation in education was crucial, and necessary, since education has been considered one of the main sources of “tensions and conflict” [68: 20] in the country itself, as well as the region for that matter, typified by the parallel system of social institutions, primarily in education and health. Education in general, and parallel education-system specifically was used as a tool to "inculcate a collective ethos" [13: 104], promote “nationalism” [19: 5; 69: 46], display “symbolic and political nationhood” [44: 2] and express “mutual mistrust” [57: 6] in Kosovo across ethnic lines for many years. Thus, radical changes in the ideology as well as practice of education were initiated and promoted.

The education sector is one of the areas where the new perception and identity of an independent, democratic, and Europeanized Kosovo have begun to be created. Through mandatory and exclusive school textbooks, young people have been introduced to the idea of a new Kosovo that values democracy, active citizenship, and civic identity. As such, the ultimately goal includes instilling and reinforcing, directly and indirectly, the perception that newly independent Kosovo is a democratic and civic country.

^a “Contested Statehood” - Marc Weller (2009). "Contested Statehood: Kosovo's Struggle to Independence." Oxford: Oxford University Press.

^b “Unsettled State” – Gezim Krasniqi (2013). "Overlapping Jurisdictions, Disputed Territory, Unsettled State: The Perplexing Case of Citizenship in Kosovo." In Shaw J. & Stiks, I. "Citizenship after Yugoslavia." London and New York: Routledge.

^c The data collected by the Humanitarian Law Center in the publication The Kosovo Memory Book 1998-2000. Retrieved on April 1, 2015 from the World Wide Web: <http://www.kosovomemorybook.org/>.

The disputes of Kosovo's existence and function as an independent country have caused many ambiguities internationally and locally. Kosovo is clearly a country with, what Bose [10: 32] calls, an "international design", which means "the application of a certain vision of state-building, which combined multicultural and civic elements" [46: 73]. Since the end of the war, in June 1999, until September 2012, politically, Kosovo, was under international community supervision – first as an international protectorate under UNMIK (UN Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo) and then as a country with conditional/supervised

The anticipated objective, ever since, has been to create a new, progressive, civic, multiethnic and cosmopolitan country rather than primordial, ethno-nationalistic and mono-ethnic one. This can, and has proven to be, quite challenging as the elements of nationalism, subjective historical perspectives and cultural/ethnic superiority are quite dominant in this part of the world. Radovic [62: 2] warns that in "post-Yugoslav states...ethno national identity preceded political/institutional/territorial polity" and Hatzopoulos [51: 1] confirms that, "...of course, the nationalism has and is still playing a significant role in the Balkans". Moreover, from all the post-Yugoslav states, the ethno-nationalism elements in Kosovo are believed to be the strongest ones. "It is often said that the cancer of nationalism which destroyed Yugoslavia began in Kosovo...it was also often said that the Yugoslav conflicts had begun there and would end there" [37: 355]. Kosovo is going through a period of state-building^d through rapid, and forceful, social change, political and economical reformation and transformation. In the words of King and Mason [43: 20], "Kosovo threatens to become a black hole in the middle of Europe", thus, it is necessary to understand that "stable societies don't just happen, they are built." [43: 263]. Building a new, stable and functional civic society, requires building a new and common identity, new internal and external perceptions, based on the emphasis of the idea that hopes for a common, joint, progressive future are more important than centuries-old cultural, historical and territorial disputes and harsh doings in the recent past; a new, civic identity of Kosovo. In order to establish a stable and functional civic society, it is necessary to create a new collective identity that transcends cultural, historical, and territorial disputes, conflicts and wars. The focus is on fostering a shared vision of a progressive future that unites people, rather than dwelling on past grievances. This process of developing a new civic identity in Kosovo has been ongoing since the end of the war, but not with challenges, aiming to create a fresh starting point and actively implementing it in everyday life. In Kosovo, "a new "neutral" beginning of history – and textualizing it in the living reality" [1: 17] has been in the process of being imposed since the end of the war.

Education has been one of the main factor in constructing, reconstructing, maintaining and even destroying identities [65: 25]. Research [21, 22, 23] has shown and recognized the great role that citizenship education has in the development of citizenship. The education of young people on democratic citizenship is critical for the development and sustainability of democracy [15, 30, 40, 41, 52, 60]. In Kosovo, the pre-university educational reforms in general, and Citizenship Education curriculum specifically, must be understood in relation to the larger picture of the new state-building, following the war and declaration of independence. Citizenship

^dThis paper recognizes and emphasizes the differences between the notions "nation-building" and "state-building". Nation includes cultural elements, while State political ones. The assumption of this paper is that, currently, Kosova is going through a state-building process and not a nation-building process. This paper adopts the following definitions: "The concepts of State and Nation are different. The state is constructed, whereas the Nation is a permanent cultural community" (Gómez-Chacón, 2003:71) - M. Gómez-Chacón (ed.) (2003). "European Identity: Individual, Group and Society." University of Deusto Bilbao..

Education is designed to produce and build the new reality of the independent country, especially among young people. Young people of every country are perceived as “citizens in the making” [49: 25] and education is considered to be one of the main social institutions contributing to the production of the types of citizens that it deems to be best for their community.

In a qualitative study [] conducted in 2011 with Citizenship Education teachers in Kosovo regarding their experiences in schools as the educational reforms were undergoing throughout the country, right after the war and the declaration of independence, it was found that that teachers reported both positive and negative experience teaching this course. The positive experiences were about the fact that this course was important, according to the Citizenship Education teachers, for the design and development of a sustainable country, especially the one that is new like Kosovo. In addition, teachers also reported that the Citizenship Education course content is engaging for students, thus, making it easier to teach and learn. However, this study also points out challenges that Citizenship Education teachers reported regarding this course, and they include lack of support and poor coordination as well as controversy over required methodology to teach the course.

Throughout this paper, Citizenship Education curriculum/subjects in Kosovo that were designed and adopted right after the war and the declaration of the independence were the scope of analysis, in order to determine the discursive construction of citizenship identity in the new, independent, democratic country. In Kosovo, Citizenship Education is a new subject in the educational curriculum and, in its current form and structure, was introduced only after the war. Changes have been initiated and made continuously in the education sector in Kosovo since the end of the war, and these changes include and relate Citizenship Education as well, however the scope of this study is the official curriculum and textbook of this subject, formally, designed and adopted in schools country-wide, in Kosovo, during the first decade of 2000, which encompasses both the post-war period and the time after the declaration of independence. As such, the Citizenship Education has become a mandatory subject for all students in the Level 3^e – upper secondary education, specifically in grades ten (10) and eleven (11) in gymnasium^f. It is a class offered for two (2) academic hours per week with a total of seventy-four (74) hours per academic year^g. The anticipation is that the knowledge and activities from the Citizenship Education classes will develop the “civic competency”^h among students in Kosovo.

More specifically, this study is guided by the following fundamental research question:

^eAccording to the Law on Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo - No.04/L –032 – the pre-university education system in the country is divided into: Level 0: Pre-Primary, Level 1: Primary, Level 2: Lower Secondary, Level 3: Upper Secondary and Level 4: Post-Secondary/Professional/Vocational

^fGymnasiums (secondary schools) that are profiled in social and linguistic sciences have Citizenship Education a mandatory course for two-years – 10 and 11th grade.

^gOfficial Citizenship Education Curriculum designed by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

Retrieved on March 13, 2015 from the World wide web at http://www.masht-gov.net/advCms/documents/klasa_10_Edukata_qytetare.pdf

^hThe Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology has identified the following competencies that students should developed during their pre-university education: 1.competency in communication and expression; 2.competency in thinking; 3.competency in learning; 4.competency in life, work and environment-related areas; 5.personal competency; and 6.civic competency

1. What are the dominant, official, discourses about statehood/citizenship in post-war, newly independent, Kosovo?

Further research sub-questions are:

1.a. How do these documents frame the idea of “citizen”? What is a good/ideal citizen according to the dominant, official, discourse of the newly established country?

1.b. What kind of state/statehood is the official ideology trying to promote?

1.c. How are multiculturalism/multiethnicity, diversity and international cooperation and integration portrayed in a state wide context?

1.d. What types of citizens are schools, according to these curriculum documents, attempting to build? What citizenship-subjectivities do they imagine?

2. Materials and Methods

This paper will focus on pre-university education and the official discourses used in education, primarily in the subject of Citizenship Education, in the process of civic identityⁱ development, primarily the sense of common and active citizenship, among young people in a newly independent, post-war country such as Kosovo. Citizenship identity is defined as, a “collective identity [that] pertains to the core of citizenship as delineating a community of which individuals define themselves as members, in as delineating a community of which they feel a sense of obligation.” [39: 70]. While the collective identity is defined as a membership and/or identification with a particular social group(s) and/or social categories [54, 74] such as, among others, ethnicity [55], nationality [64], gender [11], religion [16].

The citizenship identity in Kosovo is in the process of “being “built” whether it did not previously exist” [74, p. 11], thus, constructivism is the most appropriate theoretical framework to be employed in analyzing how this is being created. Constructivism, according to Creswell [14], advocates that people’s subjective experience is key in understanding the social world in which they live. In terms of identity development, a large body of research [6, 24, 35, 36, 56] claims identities are socially constructed and that they “can change over time, often endogenously to political and economic” [12: 250]. Analyzing discourses means analyzing the way people write and talk about an issue (known as discourse practices) as well as analyzing resources that people draw on for those discourse practices [61: 80]. Discourse analysis “takes into account the circumstances (context) of what has been said, how it was said, and why it may have been said – contextually embedded at a particular point in time at a particular location” [2: 180].

In terms of citizenship, Delanty [20: 5] stresses its “learning dimension” urging us to see it “as a constructivist process” where “citizens learn citizenship, which mostly takes place in the informal context of

ⁱThe terms “civic identity”/“civic education” and “citizenship identity”/“citizenship education” will be used interchangeably in this paper.

everyday and life and is also heavily influenced by critical and formative events in people's lives". In this paper, Citizenship Education curriculum and textbooks are used to identify the dominant discourses that young people of Kosovo are exposed to in terms of creation of the new, post-war, newly independent country civic identity.

Thus, this paper attempts to analyze the system of meanings on civic identity anticipated to be created for young people in Kosovo with the official curriculum of Citizenship Education subjects. The following documents and textbooks were analyzed for the purpose of this research:

- Official Citizenship Education Curriculum approved by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology of Kosovo: 1. Citizenship Education - 10 (grade 10) and 2. Citizenship Education 11 (grade 11).
- Official Citizenship Education Textbooks approved by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology of Kosovo: 1. Citizenship Education - 10 (grade 10) and 2. Citizenship Education 11 (grade 11).

These are government mandated textbooks that are used in all Citizenship Education courses in the schools throughout the country, more than a decade after the war in Kosovo.. These textbooks were aligned with the reformed curriculum designed by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology of Kosovo right after the war. These textbooks represent the official discourse about the citizenship identity and statehood of new, independent Kosovo. This paper focused on analyzing the meaning of citizenship as an identity as it is portrayed officially by the state, right after the war, through educational reform, the curriculum and mandatory textbooks of Citizenship Education as Kosovo is in the process of statehood building, (re)definition and function.

3.Results

3.1. New and Undefined Civic Identity

Cognizant that in Kosovo, "history, (cultural/ethnic) identity, and education were intertwined" [69: 36] very closely and "disputed interpretations of Kosovo's social history" [69: 36] common, post-war initiatives undertaken in the education sector of the country since the end of the war had the common goal, "Europeanization" [53: 2]. This was also reflected in the official discourse of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) in the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011-2016 where it clearly states that one of the goals in the education sector is "to establish, preserve and improve standards and relevance of all levels of education in Kosovo to European standards" [45: 23] and that the vision of Kosovo's education is to produce knowledgeable citizens that can be "integrated into European society and to contribute to the long term sustainable development of the country" [45: 23].

According to the Report on Citizenship Education in Europe [26: 17], "citizenship education refers to the aspects of education at school level intend to prepare student to become active citizens, by ensuring that they have the necessary knowledge, skills, and attitudes to contribute to the development and well-being of the society in which they live." To this note, an international longitudinal study on Citizenship Education conducted in the framework of the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA), civic

education is defined as “knowledge and understanding of formal institutions and processes of civic life” [32: 22].

According to the official Curriculum Framework for the Pre-University Education of the Ministry of Education in Kosovo, in 2011, the civic competencies are defined as those that create (read: key learning outcome) “responsible citizens”, who among others, understand, tolerate and respect diversity among people in Kosovo as well as assume responsibility and display civic participations for issues of general public interest [18: 17].

The Citizenship Education curriculums try to build citizens that will be functional and productive in the society it tries to create. As [44: 26] points out, “textbooks provide an insight into the symbolic sculpting of nationhood within the education system.”

Table 1: Number of academic hours per year per topic/issue in the Citizenship Education classes.

	ACADEMIC HOURS PER ACADEMIC YEAR
CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION – GRADE 10TH	72
GOVERNANCE	18
POWER AND AUTHORITY	22
LAW	16
CITIZENSHIP PRACTICES AND BELIEFS	6
MEDIA EDUCATION	10
CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION – GRADE 11TH	70
INTEGRATION	30
INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION	25
GLOBAL PROBLEMS AND ENVIRONMENT	15

SOURCE: Citizenship Education Curriculum – Grade 10th and Grade 11th. (2011). Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

In the newly independent Kosovo, the educational reforms are attempting to create, what Kerr and colleagues (2004), call, “progressive schools” where schools develop and incorporate the citizenship_education as part of their formal curriculum and program as well as develop and incorporate civic education in the broader community around them. Biesta [7: 5] notes that, “in new and emerging democracies the focus has been on how education can contribute to the formation of democratic citizens and the promotion of a democratic culture.” Consequently, education is seen as a mean for “production of good citizens” [7: 1]. In addition, education, and schooling in general, are seen also as social constructs representing what society considers to be important and valuable [8]. In Kosovo, the aspirations towards internationalism and European recognition and integrations are clear. Boldly, through education, Kosovo defines itself as, “a knowledge society, integrated in European trends with equal opportunities for personal development of all its members, who in return contribute to the sustainable economic and social development.” [70: 9]. Consequently, the official overall mission of the pre-university education of Kosovo, among others, is to promote “values of democratic citizenship” [70: 9]. The Council of Europe and the European Commission as they promote democratic citizenship defines it as “the belief that citizenship should be based on democratic principles and certain values, e.g. pluralism, respect for human dignity and the rule of law.” [73: 21].

As Kosovo tries to build the new state and new democracy, it is also necessary to build citizens that not only embrace democracy and pluralism, but also respect, practice and live by it. As an aspiring European country, Kosovo is trying to build itself in the reflection of international and European standards and requirements, thus, following the recommendations of the Council of Europe's Resolution of 1997 on Education for Democratic Citizenship that states "education for democratic citizenship can contribute to a social cohesion through learning to participate in the life of society, to assume responsibility and to live together" [17: 3].

The overall goals of the Citizenship Education, according to the official curriculums,^j are to create new citizens of Kosovo with the following traits:

- Skilled to understand, analyze and influence social policies and their implementation
- Understand the principles of governance, power and authority
- Informed about values of contemporary societies such as freedom, equality, justice, solidarity, etc.
- Understand the rule of law in democratic governance; be able to compare and contrast legislation and constitution
- Understand the role of electronic and written media in society as well as the public's right for information
- Cognizant of highly interrelated and codependent social processes and phenomena in the world today
- Tolerant towards other different opinions and perspectives and for peaceful solutions of conflicts in the community and the world
- Cognizant that the future of Kosovo depends on their present civic actions and participations

The ultimate goal of the Citizenship Education subject-specific-curriculum is aligned with that of the overall education system of the new state – Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education as designed officially by the Ministry of Education. Citizenship Education courses, among others, are to create "responsible citizens" as one of the necessary competencies of the. In Kosovo, the official discourses, as defined by the appropriate governmental institution (Ministry of Education) and represented in the Citizenship Education curriculums and textbook, are attempting to create a system of meaning about the new citizenship identity with the following elements: 1. political and social literacy, 2. political and social participation, 3. cosmopolitanism and not nationalism 4. media, environmental and global critical thinking, and 5. European and International integration. In other words, a citizen of newly independent Kosovo should have substantial knowledge about the design of the state of Kosovo,^k politically, how it is created and how it functions, rights and responsibilities of both social institutions and individuals, and democracy and opportunities for social actions and participations. Kosovo is portrayed as a new, multiethnic, democratic, civic state with citizens who possess and cherish the values of freedom, equality, justice, conflict resolution and solidarity.

A Kosovar citizen should be a cosmopolitan citizen and/or a global citizen, free of prejudice and embrace

^j Citizenship Education Curriculum – Grade 10 and Grade 11. (2011). Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

^k The Article 1 – Definition of the State – of the Constitution of Kosova defines it as a Republic state. Constitution can be retrieved at: <http://www.kushtetutakosoves.info/repository/docs/Constitution.of.the.Republic.of.Kosovo.pdf>
In addition, the Citizenship Education – Grade 10 textbook defines Kosovas a Republic state.

diversity and multiculturalism, according to the official and dominant discourse. The cosmopolitanism citizenship has been portrayed as an European and/or International citizenship or as Beck and Grande (2007) call it, “cosmopolitan Europe”. As an aspiring member of the European Union, Kosovo’s discourses, in all social, political and economical areas, including education, are, at least formally, aligned with European and international standards. Kosovo’s Curricular Framework on Pre-University Education in general, and Citizenship Education curriculums specifically, same as the European Commission, EU Youth Strategy 2010-2018, attempts to “promote the active citizenship, social inclusion and solidarity of all young people.” [25]. A Kosovar citizen, according to the official, national and international, discourse is a true “young European”¹. In the Citizenship Education Textbook 11 it is boldly stated that the future of Kosovo is in the European Union.

Although the citizens of Kosovo are "Europeans in waiting" or "Isolated Europeans"^m, Kosovo as an "European country," follows fully the recommendation of the European Commissions’ Education, Audiovisual and Culture Executive Agency on Citizenship Education in Europe that, “the national context is not the only focus of citizenship education, the European and international dimensions are also important.” [26: 31].

4. Conclusion

4.1. Towards Kosovar Civic Identity

It is important to note that the Citizenship Education courses make no references to the development of national and cultural identity of citizens of Kosovo, rather they focus exclusively on its civic identity providing knowledge, values, skills for a democratic, European, newly independent state. Thus, Kosovo is in the process of creating a “civic” nations-base citizenship identity as oppose to “ethnic”-base citizenship one.

In the latter, ethnic, religious and cultural identities, which are seen as hereditary, are in focus and importance, while the civic nations-base citizenship, usually a combination of republican and liberal models, focuses on political principles and processes [9, 29, 34]. It is important to note that the Citizenship Education textbooks mention absolutely nothing specifically about variety cultural and religious identities in Kosovo. Their sole focus is the post-war, independent, civic and European Kosovo. As Ross [63: 51] clearly points out, “any new notion of citizenship or identity based on the new Europe must be distinctly different from the old citizenships of the nation-states: less ethnocentric, more diverse more inclusive, less wedded to nationalistic conceptions.” In Kosovo, through citizenship development and education, there is a tendency to encourage children and young people “to see beyond the boundaries of their own nations” [69: 39]. An attempt to create a solid social system of meaning that will embrace and promote what social psychologists Gibson and Condor [28] called “horizontal citizenship” – identification with a human community and “vertical citizenship – identification with a political

¹ After the declaration of independence of Kosova, an international marketing company, BBR Saatchi &Saatchi, was contracted by the Government of Kosova for public relations and promotion purposes of the new state internationally. One of the advertisement, and the main one, created for this purpose and advertised worldwide had the message “Kosovo – the young Europeans”.

^m With Kosova citizenship – Kosova passport – one cannot enter any European Union country without prior visa approval. Kosova does not have a visa liberalization agreement with the EU – meaning its citizens cannot travel, even for touristic purposes to EU countries without a visa – something that all the rest of the countries in the former Yugoslavia have.

institution is in the process in Kosovo. In Kosovo, like in many Eastern Europe countries, according to Sztompka [72] the idea of new civic citizenship was considered as a connecting point and potential solution for social order in times of crises and transitions. People need to have the sense of belonging [3]. The sense of belonging has shown to be critical for the development of the citizenship [5, 58].

Citizenship identity is a social identity as it is shared by other, similar, people as well. Civic citizenship, in Kosovo's discourse is anticipated and expected to be a glue and a medicine for broken social relations as a consequence of the war. Kosovar citizens, regardless of cultural background or perspectives, are to be identified with their new state, principles of democracy, equality and tolerance and are to work towards European citizenship. This "group identification...members will see themselves as minimally similar" [36: 132] will be the basis for production of a common social identity in Kosovo. Citizenship identity has the potential to be a solid collective identity that unites people. In discussions on citizenship and collective identity, Karolewski [39: 82] points out that "citizenship identity represents political collective identity, as opposed to other social identities. The features of such political, collective identity are a certain degree of durability, bridging capability, and integrative performance. In this sense, citizenship represents a political category pertaining to membership in a political community (from the perspective of the citizen) or a method of cultivating political community (from the perspective of the state polity), which makes it an integrative phenomenon. Therefore, the notion of citizenship identity potentially offers a more promising concept with which to link citizenship and collective identity".

The new civic identity that is in the process of production in Kosovo, has to be understood under the social psychological lenses of Stryker and Burke [70: 284-297] and five (5) arguments offered as a theory of identity in the modern society and they are: 1. identities are relational, 2 identities are socially constructed, 3. identities are socially structured, 4.

people typically have multiple identities and 5. identities have social consequences. However, the political and social reality in Kosovo for the development of citizenship in general and civic identity in former Yugoslavia countries in general and in Kosovo specifically "is not the most favourable one in which a new citizenship regime can be born in and mature" [46: 80] due to its past as "a post-socialist, post-partition and post-conflict region which has witnessed, over the last 20 years, multiple processes of disintegration, successful and unsuccessful attempts at secession, and a huge variety of internal political and territorial arrangements." [67: 1]. To this day, Kosovo as a political entity remains as an "unfinished and unconsolidated state with no clear territorial boundaries" [46: 80] and as a result the borders of the polity do not coincide with those of citizenship [46: 77].

The definition of the state of Kosovo, hence, its citizenship identity is in the process of infantile development. A new system of meaning regarding its identity is in process and the previous system of meaning is being changed.

The state, society and culture are in transition in Kosovo, thus, the social and cultural value orientation, practices and overall identity development is in transition as well and "in times of cultural and technological change, when our symbolic order is being challenged and new social representations emerge, it is likely that a

number of controversial identity projects will compete for predominance.

Thereby, the meanings of categories may remain under dispute for a long time, gain new meanings, or disappear altogether.” [47: 192]. In Kosovo, it remains to be seen whether the new civic and European identity will remain under dispute, will gain new meanings and be accepted or will disappear altogether.

The following can be considered as potential limitations of this discourse analysis study of the citizenship education textbooks and curriculum:

- Sample size and selection used for this the study focused only on textbooks and curriculum for the Citizenship Education Course in grades 10th and 11th. However, it did not analyze the materials/textbook/curriculum used in lower grades for this course. This narrow focus might limit the conclusions drawn and the ability to apply the findings to Citizenship Education textbooks and curriculums of other grade levels in the country.
- Contextual factors could be overlooked in the analysis, as the study might not fully consider the broader social, cultural, and historical contexts surrounding the creation and use of the textbook. These external factors can significantly shape the content and meaning created and conveyed within.
- Assumption about influence might happen when the study makes assumptions about the influence of the textbooks and curriculums on students' understanding and behavior without considering other crucial factors that can impact learning outcomes.
- Scope of analysis of this study may be limited, focusing solely on the textbook's content and not delving into its actual implementation in real classroom settings or exploring how teachers and students interact with the material during instruction.

The following are recommendations should be considered to enhance the quality and the scope of future studies in this area:

- Longitudinal Studies – conducting a longitudinal study will enable researchers to study the evolution and changes of the Citizenship Education textbooks and curriculums in Kosovo over time.
- Multi-perspectives – conducting a mixed-methods, more holistic study that will incorporate perspectives of various stakeholders such as teachers, students, parents, and even educational policymakers on Citizenship Education
- Effectiveness and Influence – conducting a study that will investigate the impact of Citizenship Education textbooks and curriculums on young people’s value orientation and attitude formation and change.
- Inclusive education – conducting a study that will examine how Citizenship Education is catered to the needs of diverse learners, including those with special needs, marginalized and from minority communities in the country.
- Incorporate Educational Policy Reform Analysis – conducting a study that will analyze the impact of educational policies and reforms in the country on the Citizenship Education conception, definition, presentation, and even implementation.

Acknowledgements

N/A

References

- [1]. M. Albertini (2012). "Kosovo: An identity between Local and Global Ethnopolitics Papers, No. 15." Retrieved from the World Wide Web on February 19, 2015, from <http://www.ethnopolitics.org/ethnopolitics-papers/EPP015.pdf>.
- [2]. M. Bamberg, A. De Fina, and D. Schiffrin (2012). "Discourse Identity Construction." In S. J. Schwartz, K. Luyckx, and V. L. Vignoles (Eds.), "Handbook of Identity Theory and Research – Volume 1." Springer, New York.
- [3]. R. F. Baumeister and M. R. Leary (1995). "The need for belong: Desire for interpersonal attachments as a fundamental human motivation." *Psychological Bulletin*, 117, 497-529. doi:10.1037/0033-2909.117.3.497.
- [4]. U. Beck and E. Grande (2007). "Cosmopolitan Europe." Cambridge, Polity Press.
- [5]. R. Bellamy, D. Castiglione, and E. Santoro (2004). "Lineages of European citizenship: rights, belonging and participation in eleven nation-states." London: Palgrave. doi:10.1057/9780230522442.
- [6]. P. Berger and T. Luckman (eds) (1966). "The Social Construction of Reality." Harmondsworth, Penguin.
- [7]. G. J. Biesta (2001). "Learning Democracy in School and Society: Education, Lifelong learning, and the Politics of Citizenship." Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers.
- [8]. L. Brady and K. Kennedy (2007). "Curriculum Construction, 3rd edn." Sydney: Pearson Education.
- [9]. W. R. Brubaker (1992). "Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany." Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- [10]. S. Bose (2005). "The Bosnian state a decade after Dayton." *International Peacekeeping*, 12 (3), 322-335. doi:10.1080/13533310500074028.
- [11]. K. Bussey and A. Bandura (1999). "Social cognitive theory of gender development and differentiation." *Psychological Review*, 106, 676-713. doi:10.1037/0033-295X.106.4.676.
- [12]. K. Chandra (2009). "A Constructivist Dataset on Ethnicity and Institution." In R. Abdelal, M. Y. Herrera, A. Johnston, and R. McDermott (Eds.), "Measuring Identity-A guide for Social Scientists." Cambridge University Press. doi:10.1017/cbo9780511810909.010.
- [13]. H. Clark (2000). "Civil resistance in Kosovo." London; Sterling, VA: Pluto Press.
- [14]. L. Creswell (2003). "Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches." London: Sage.
- [15]. B. Crick (1998). "Education for Citizenship and the Teaching for Democracy in Schools." London: Qualifications and Curriculum Authority.
- [16]. B. Cohen, D. E. Hall, H. G. Koenig, and K. G. Meador (2005). "Social versus individual motivation: Implications for normative definitions of religions orientation." *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, 9, 48-61. doi:10.1207/s15327957pspr0901_4.
- [17]. Council of Europe (2000). "Project on 'Education for Democratic Citizenship': Resolution adopted by the Council of Europe Ministers of Education at their 20th Sessions, Cracow, Poland, 15-17 October

- 2000, DGIV/EDU/CIT (2000) 40." Strasbourg: Council of Europe.
- [18]. Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo (2011). Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. Retrieved on March 13, 2015, from the World Wide Web at http://www.masht-gov.net/advCms/documents/Korniza_e_Kurrikules_anglisht_2013.pdf.
- [19]. L. Davies (1999, August). "Education in Kosovo: Report to the British Council." Birmingham: Centre for International Education and Research, School of Education, University of Birmingham.
- [20]. G. Delanty (2007). "Citizenship as a learning process." EUROZINE. Retrieved from the World Wide Web on February 6, 2015, from <http://www.eurozine.com/pdf/2007-06-30-delanty-en.pdf>.
- [21]. J. Dewey (1916/1966). "Democracy and education." New York: Macmillan.
- [22]. D. Easton and J. Dennis (1969). "Children in the political system: Origins of political legitimacy." New York: McGraw-Hill.
- [23]. D. Easton (1965). "A systems analysis of political life." New York: John Wiley.
- [24]. T. Eriksen (1993). "Ethnicity and Nationalism: Anthropological Perspectives." London: Pluto.
- [25]. European Commission (2009). "EU Youth Strategy 2010-2018. Council Resolution on a renewed framework for European cooperation in the youth field – (2010-2018), 2009/C3 11/01." Official Journal of the European Union. Retrieved from the World Wide Web on January 5, 2015, http://ec.europa.eu/youth/policy/youth_strategy/index_en.htm.
- [26]. EURYDICE (2012). "Citizenship Education in Europe." Education, Audiovisual and Culture Executive Agency. Retrieved from the World Wide Web on January 5, 2015, at <http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/education/eurydice>.
- [27]. M. Fourie (1999). "Institutional Transformation at South African Universities: Implications for Academic Staff." *Higher Education*, 28, 275-290. doi: 10.1023/A:1003768229291.
- [28]. S. Gibson and S. Condor (2009). "State institutions and social identity: National representation in soldiers' and civilians' interview talk concerning military service." *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 48, 313-336. doi: 10.1348/014466608X349496.
- [29]. L. Greenfeld (1992). "Nationalism: Five Roads to Modernity." Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- [30]. T. Hahn (1998). "Becoming Political: Comparative Perspectives on Citizenship Education." Albany, NY: Sunny Press.
- [31]. D. Hall (2004). "A History of Education for Citizenship." London, New York: Routledge Falmer.
- [32]. International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) (2010). "ICCS 2009 International report. Civic Knowledge, attitudes, and engagement among lower-secondary students in 38 countries." Amsterdam: IEA.
- [33]. M. IgnHere are the IEEE-style citations for the given sources in the provided order (continued):
- [34]. M. Ignatieff (1993). "Blood and Belonging: Journeys into the New Nationalism." New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux.
- [35]. P. Jackson and J. Penrose (eds) (1993). "Constructions of Race, Place and Nation." London, UCL Press.
- [36]. R. Jenkins (1996). "Social Identity." London: Routledge. doi: 10.4324/9780203292990.
- [37]. T. Judah (2009). "The Serbs - History, Myth and the Destruction of Yugoslavia." New Haven: Yale

University Press.

- [38]. E. Kadriu, J. Selimos, and J. Tower (2010). "What it takes to be a Good Teacher: Attitudes of Effective Teachers according to Secondary School Students in Kosovo." Prishtina: International Progressive Education.
- [39]. I.P. Karolewski (2010). "Citizenship and Collective Identity in Europe." London and New York: Routledge.
- [40]. D. Kemp (1997). "Discovering Democracy: Civics and Citizenship Education. Ministerial Statement." Canberra: Minister for Schools, Vocational Education and Training.
- [41]. K. Kennedy (ed.) (2003). "Citizenship Education and the Modern State." London: Falmer Press.
- [42]. D. Kerr, E. Ireland, J. Lopes, R. Craig, and E. Cleaver (2004). "Citizenship Education Longitudinal Study: Second Annual Report: First Longitudinal Survey, Making Citizenship Education Real." London, DfES/RR 531.
- [43]. I.King and W. Mason (2006). "Peace at any Price." London: Cornell University Press.
- [44]. D. Kostovicova (2005). "Kosovo - The politics of identity and space." Routledge.
- [45]. Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011 - 2016 (2011). Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. Retrieved on April 2, 2015, from the World Wide Web at http://www.mashtgov.net/advCms/documents/KESP_2011_2016.pdf.
- [46]. G. Krasniqi (2013). "Overlapping jurisdictions, disputed territory, unsettled state: the perplexing case of citizenship in Kosovo." In J. Shaw and I. Stiks (Eds.), "Citizenship after Yugoslavia." London and New York: Routledge.
- [47]. N. Kronberger and W. Wagner (2007). "Inviolable versus Alterable identities - Culture, biotechnology, and resistance." In G. Moloney & I. Walker (Eds.), "Social Representations and Identity: Content, Process, and Power." New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- [48]. J. Lave and E. Wenger (1991). "Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation." Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. doi: 10.1017/CBO9780511815355.
- [49]. T. H. Marshall (1950). "Citizenship and social class and other essays." Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- [50]. S. Hall (1996). "New ethnicities." In H. Baker Jr., M. Diawara, and R. Lindeborg (eds), "Black British Cultural Studies." Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- [51]. P. Hatzopoulos (2008). "The Balkans Beyond Nationalism and Identity: International Relations and Ideology." New York: I.B Tauris.
- [52]. S. Macedo et al. (2005). "Democracy at Risk." Washington, DC: Brookings Institute.
- [53]. The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework - Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education – Discussion White Paper – September 2001. Kosovo, UNMIK.
- [54]. H. Tajfel and J. C. Turner (1986). "The social identity theory of intergroup behavior." In S. Worchel & W. Austin (eds.), "The psychology of intergroup behavior" (pp. 7-24). Chicago: Nelson Hall.
- [55]. D. M. Taylor (1997). "The quest of collective identity. The plight of disadvantaged ethnic minorities." Canadian Psychology, 38 (3), 174-190. doi: 10.1037/0708-5591.38.3.174.
- [56]. M. K. Okuma-Nystrom (2009). "Globalization, Identities and Diversified School Education." In J. Zajda, H. Daun, & L. J. Shaha (Eds.), "Nation-building, Identity and Citizenship Education."

Melbourne, Cambera, Stockholm: Springer.

- [57]. Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) (2013). "Parallel Structure in Kosovo." UNMIK.
- [58]. A.Osler and H. Starkey (2001). "Citizenship Education and National Identities in France and England: inclusive or exclusive?" *Oxford Review of Education*, 27 (2), 288-305. doi:10.1080/03054980124800.
- [59]. Oxfam (2006). "Education for Global Citizenship: A Guide for Schools."
- [60]. W. Parker (ed.) (1996). "Educating the Democratic Mind." Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.
- [61]. J. Potter and M. Wetherell (1995). "Discourse Analysis." In J. A. Smith, R. Harre, and L. Van Langenlove (1995), "Rethinking Methods in Psychology." London: SAGE Publication. doi:10.4135/9781446221792.n6.
- [62]. M. Radovic (2013). "Citizenship and Religion in the Post Yugoslav States." Scotland: University of Edinburgh.
- [63]. A.Ross (2002). "Citizenship Education and Curriculum Theory." In S. David & H. L. (Eds.), "Citizenship Education and the Curriculum." London: ABLEX Publishing.
- [64]. D. Schildkraut (2005). "Press 'One' for English: Language policy, public opinion, and American identity." Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- [65]. W. Schulz, J. Fraillon, J. Ainley, B. Losito, and D. Kerr (2008). "International Civic and Citizenship Education Study." Amsterdam, The Netherlands: International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA).
- [66]. E.Selimos, E. Kadriu and J.Tower (2011). "Teacher Experiences of Curricular Reform in Kosova" Prishtina: International Progressive Education.
- [67]. J. Shaw and I. Stiks (2013). "Introduction: Citizenship in the New States of South Eastern Europe." In J. Shaw and I. Stiks (Eds.), "Citizenship after Yugoslavia." London and New York: Routledge. doi:10.1017/cbo9781139030694.001.
- [68]. M. Sommers and P. Buckland (2004). "Parallel Worlds. Rebuilding the Education System in Kosovo." Paris: UNESCO.
- [69]. A.Stables (2003). "Learning for diversity." Aldershot, Ashgate.
- [70]. Strategy for Development of Pre-University Education in Kosovo 2007 - 2017. Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. Retrieved on March 1, 2015, from the World Wide Web at http://www.masht-gov.net/advCms/documents/Strategy_for_Development_of_pre-university_education_in_Kosovo.pdf.
- [71]. S. Stryker and P. Burke (2000). "The past, present, and the future of an identity theory." *Social Psychology Quarterly*, 63, 284-297. doi:10.2307/2695840.
- [72]. P. Sztompka (1994). "Civil Society and Public Space: The Dialectics of Post-Communism Systems." Paper delivered to the Thirteenth World Congress of Sociology. Germany: University of Bielefield.
- [73]. "Under Construction – Citizenship, Youth and European. T-Kit on European Citizenship" (2003). Council of Europe and European Commission.
- [74]. M. Van Zomeren, T. Postmes, and R. Spears (2008). "Toward an integrative social identity model of collective action: A quantitative research synthesis of three socio-psychological perspectives."

Psychological Bulletin, 134, 504-535. doi:10.1037/0033-2909.134.4.504.

- [75]. V. L. Vignoles, S. J. Schwartz, and K. Luyckx (2012). "Introduction: Toward an Integrative View of Identity." In S. J. Schwartz, K. Luyckx, and V. L. Vignoles (Eds.), "Handbook of Identity Theory and Research – Volume 1." Springer, New York.